

PD Dr. Matthias Knuth

Comment to:

Redesigning the Governance of Employment Policies –
Lessons from Danish Experiences (Bredgaard & Larsen)

CARMA's 25th Anniversary Conference
October 10, 2008, Aalborg University
Workshop 4

Danish-German Commonalities

- strong tradition of municipal self-administration
- 2 regimes of social protection for workless people: 'insured' and 'non-insured'
- traditionally 'soft' social case worker approach in municipal services for the non-insured
- **explicit** goals of the reform:
 - equal treatment irrespective of ue insurance status
 - 'integrated services are better services' ('joined-up government')
- **implicit** goals of the reform:
 - extending strategic national control over employment policies
 - expanding responsibilities of the national Ministry of Labour
- competition of 2 operational models: full municipalisation as a test pilot in about 15% of local units
- standardisation, monitoring, steering:
 - categorisation of customers, standard treatment packages
 - performance goals, numerical benchmarking
 - 'naming and shaming'

Danish-German Dissimilarities (1)

	Denmark	Germany	Why?
principal target of public criticism	municipalities	national PES	2 tiers (DK) vs. 3 tiers (DE) of government; m's patronised by <i>Länder</i>
workless population affected by 'operational policy'	total (stronger implications for soc. ass. customers)	'non-insured' only (stronger implications for former ue ass. customers)	2 benefits (DK) vs. previously 3 benefits (DE); ue ass. and soc. ass. merged)
scope of integration	services only; service-benefit integration disrupted for soc. ass. customers	services and benefits	traditions of separation (DK) vs. integration (DE) of services and benefits
depth of operational integration (mainstream model)	co-location of 2 separate executives: <i>'flat-sharing community'</i>	legally united executive forged by delegation of staff and resources from two still autonomous agents: <i>'common-law marriage'</i>	DE: decisions on benefits and sanctions require not just 'one face' but 'one fist' to the customer

Danish-German Dissimilarities (2)

	Denmark	Germany	Why?
Which side dominates the performance style?	municipalities	national PES	different numerical imbalances of former municipal vs. PES customers and staff
full municipalisation as a future option?	yes	no longer likely	'centralised decentralisation'
monitoring and steering	centralised	polycentristic, contested, sometimes contradicting	possible in centralised states, difficult in federal states
current problem focus	implementation of 'formal' policy	legalisation or separation of 'common-law marriage' in jobcentres	German constitution precludes federal-municipal alliances

Similar goals, methods, fashions X different institutional starting points
 ⇒ similar 'formal' policies and individual effects
 + dissimilar 'operational' policies **and trajectories of governance**